

where
are the
poor ?

*Experiences with the
Development and Use
of Poverty Maps*



**Norbert Henninger
Mathilde Snel**

Where are the Poor?

Experiences with the Development and Use of Poverty Maps

Norbert Henninger

Mathilde Snel

Published by World Resources Institute, Washington, DC
and UNEP/GRID-Arendal, Arendal, Norway

This report is also available at <http://population.wri.org/> and <http://www.povertymap.net/pub.htm>

2002



CAROL ROSEN AND OTTO SIMONETT
PUBLICATION DIRECTORS

HYACINTH BILLINGS AND JANET FERNANDEZ SKAALVIK
PRODUCTION MANAGERS

MAGGIE POWELL
COVER DESIGN AND LAYOUT

KAREN HOLMES
EDITING

JOHNATHAN KOOL
MAP LAYOUT

Each World Resources Institute and UNEP/GRID-Arendal report represents a timely, scholarly treatment of a subject of public concern. We take responsibility for choosing the study topic and guaranteeing its authors and researchers freedom of inquiry. We also solicit and respond to the guidance of advisory panels and expert reviewers. Unless otherwise stated, however, all the interpretation and findings set forth in our publications are those of the authors.

Copyright © 2002 World Resources Institute and UNEP/GRID-Arendal.
All rights reserved.

ISBN: 1-56973-520-4

Library of Congress Control Number: 2002109922

Printed in Birkeland, Norway on chlorine-free paper with Bio Sprint
(100% plant based) ink.

The presentations and designations used in regard to the legal status of any country, territory, city, or area within its authority, or the delineation of its frontiers or boundaries, do not reflect the opinion of WRI or UNEP/GRID-Arendal or cooperating agencies.

Photo Credits

Tegucigalpa street girl eating in Honduras, photo by Paul Jeffrey,
pablito@datum.hn.

Farm woman carrying heavy head load of fuelwood, Tagalla area, Sri Lanka,
1993, photo by G. Bizzarri, FAO MediaBase, photo-library@fao.org.

A view of Mathare (Nairobi) in the wake of the torrential El Niño rains
(1997), Shootback: Photos by Kids from the Nairobi Slums, Booth-Clibborn
Editions, London, 1999, lanawong@yahoo.com.

Contents

Foreword	v	Recommendations	31
Acknowledgments	vii	List of Figures	
Executive Summary	1	Figure 1	
Introduction	5	Poverty maps for Ecuador at various levels of spatial resolution	7
Background on Poverty Mapping	7	Figure 2	
Small area estimation	7	Two indicators of human wellbeing at various spatial and temporal scales for Brazil	16
Other poverty mapping methods	8	Figure 3	
Caveats	9	Linkage of rural poverty rates and ethnic minorities in Vietnam	19
Box 1: Poverty mapping – generic steps	8	Figure 4	
Box 2: Methods of poverty mapping	10	Overlay of Guatemalan poverty map and roads data	20
Study Approach	13	Figure 5	
Case selection	13	Mapping poverty and the spread of cholera in KwaZulu Natal, South Africa, January 2001	22
Interview procedure	13	Figure 6	
Highlights of Use and Impact	15	Combining qualitative and quantitative poverty maps in Cambodia	23
Poverty reduction strategies and programs	15	Bibliography	33
Targeting of national budgets and investment programs	18	Appendix 1: List of Abbreviations and Acronyms	34
Emergency response and food aid	22	Appendix 2: Questionnaire	36
State- and local-level decision-making	24	Appendix 3: List of Interviewees	38
Increased transparency of public decision-making	24	Appendix 4: List of Case Study Notes and Summary Tables	39
Discussion of Findings	25	Brazil	40
Demand issues	25	Ecuador	43
<i>Linkage between user demand and subsequent applications of poverty maps</i>		Guatemala	45
<i>Untapped potential for environmental and other applications</i>		Jamaica	47
<i>Potential private-sector users</i>		Nicaragua	48
Methodological issues	26	Panama	50
<i>Importance of a credible, transparent method</i>		Peru	52
<i>Overcoming problems with data availability and access</i>		Burkina Faso	54
<i>Issues of data quality</i>		Madagascar	55
<i>Significance of up-to-date information and high-resolution maps</i>		Malawi	56
<i>Need for comparative analyses and more sophisticated spatial analyses</i>		Mozambique	58
Dialogue, collaboration, and dissemination	28	South Africa	60
<i>Importance of senior-level support</i>		Cambodia	62
<i>Need for collaborative approaches</i>		Vietnam	64
<i>Importance of an active dissemination strategy</i>			
Capacity development and long-term sustainability	29		
<i>Institutional strengthening</i>			
<i>Strategy for building a cadre of skilled poverty map producers and analysts</i>			
<i>Strategy to help finance poverty map production</i>			
<i>Tools and skills for sustainability</i>			
Box 3: Applying the lessons learned to poverty mapping in East Africa	30		

Foreword

The quest to eliminate poverty is one of the great human endeavors of our time. Never before has humankind had the economic resources and technological tools to end human deprivation. We do now.

One essential tool is *information*. In all countries and at all times, information is power. Information forms the basis of knowledge, which can be used to direct finite human and financial resources to projects with the greatest impact on improving the lot of poor people. Information is key to enable people to lift themselves out of poverty—a condition characterized not only by lack of income and material goods, but also by lack of *opportunity*. Foremost among these are the opportunity to learn and the opportunity to participate in decision-making.

In *Where are the Poor? Experiences with the Development and Use of Poverty Maps*, Norbert Henninger and Mathilde Snel examine a powerful new information analysis and communication tool that has come into prominence in recent years. They show how poverty maps can be used by international, national, and local decision-makers to direct investments in human development. They demonstrate the importance of the *spatial* dimensions of poverty. All too often, pockets of deprivation remain unrecognized alongside greater prosperity. Poverty mapping pinpoints places where development lags. It can highlight the location and condition of infrastructure and natural resource assets that are critical to poverty reduction. Armed with this knowledge, policymakers can deploy highly targeted antipoverty expenditures and interventions to reach the neediest people by the most effective and affordable means.

Drawing on case studies from 14 countries in Africa, Asia, and Latin America, the authors review how poverty maps were used and some of the factors constraining their use in a wide variety of geographic and institutional settings. Examples reveal how development decisions, investments in infrastructure, and targeting of assistance were shaped by poverty mapping in the countries studied. The report also points to the largely untapped potential for applications incorporating the risks and opportunities associated with environmental

factors impacting poverty as well as applications to assist the planning and operations of private businesses and other non-traditional users. Especially intriguing is the role of poverty mapping in shedding light on antipoverty policy options, sparking fresh public debate, and strengthening civil society's call for increased transparency and accountability of government decision-making.

From such experiences come lessons that can guide future poverty mapping initiatives in other countries. Emerging as pivotal themes in the study's findings are the need for collaborative approaches and senior-level support as well as the importance of active dissemination of results. Recommendations aimed at national and international actors sketch a plan for sustaining poverty mapping in the countries studied and expanding its frontiers to all developed and developing countries. Particularly in the latter, poverty mapping must be viewed as an essential, long-term capacity development and institutional strengthening exercise. In all cases, early, continuing stakeholder involvement combined with data access for all those who want it are cornerstones of a successful poverty mapping effort.

This report is the product of a strong collaboration between the World Resources Institute (WRI), UNEP/GRID-Arendal, and dozens of country experts supplying information and insights for the cases studied. The Netherlands Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency, and the FAO-CGIAR-UNEP Poverty Mapping Project funded by the Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs provided critical support for this study. We are pleased to express our appreciation to all for their exceptional encouragement and generosity.

JONATHAN LASH
PRESIDENT
WORLD RESOURCES INSTITUTE

SVEIN TVEITDAL
MANAGING DIRECTOR
UNEP/GRID-ARENDAL

Acknowledgments

This study would not have been possible without grants from the Netherlands Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency, and the joint FAO-CGIAR-UNEP Poverty Mapping Project funded by the Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs. We are grateful to them for their support.

We are deeply indebted to the 37 respondents who devoted considerable time and energy to help us prepare the 14 case study notes (summarized in Appendix 4 and available at <http://population.wri.org/> or <http://www.povertymap.net/pub.htm>). Their patience during often lengthy discussions, willingness to share numerous documents, and dedication to comment on different drafts provided the foundation from which we could synthesize their experiences with the development and use of poverty maps. A very special thank you to:

Brazil: Maria Luiza de Aguiar Marques (Fundação João Pinheiro) and José Carlos Libânio (UNDP);

Ecuador: Jesko Hentschel (World Bank), Peter Lanjouw (World Bank), Ana Maria Larrea (Institute of Ecuadorian Studies), Carlos Larrea, (consultant), and Fernando Rodríguez (Ecociencia);

Guatemala: Alessandra Gallio (Ministry of Education), Kathy Lindert (World Bank), Vivian Mack (SEGEPLAN), Jyotsna Puri (World Bank), and Carlos Sobrado (World Bank);

Jamaica: Scarlet Gillings (Jamaica Social Investment Fund), Pauline Knight (Planning Institute of Jamaica), and Berk Özler (World Bank);

Nicaragua: Florencia Castro-Leal (World Bank), Carlos Lacayo, (FISE), Matilde Neret (SETEC), Berk Özler (World Bank), and Carlos Sobrado (World Bank);

Panama: Edith de Kowalczyk (Ministry of Economy and Finance), Francisco Lagruta (Nutrition Department, Panama Ministry of Health), Kathy Lindert (World Bank), Salvador Moreno (Social Investment Fund), and Carlos Sobrado (World Bank);

Peru: Jesko Hentschel (World Bank), Norbert Schady (World Bank), and Patricia Vásquez Sotero (Ministry of Economy and Finance);

Burkina Faso: David Bigman (International Service for National Agriculture Research);

Madagascar: Leslie Caro Morinière (Ministry of Interior and CARE), Jesko Hentschel (World Bank), and Berk Özler (World Bank);

Malawi: Todd Benson (IFPRI);

Mozambique: Ken Simler (IFPRI);

South Africa: Miriam Babita (Statistics South Africa) and Berk Özler (World Bank);

Cambodia: Srey Chanthy (consultant), Alain Gouffeu (Asian Development Bank), Mack Ramachandran (World Food Programme), and Boreak Sik (World Food Programme); and

Vietnam: Nisha Agrawal (World Bank), Bob Baulch (Institute of Development Studies, University of Sussex), Christopher Gibbs (World Bank), Nicholas Minot (IFPRI), and Alan Piazza (World Bank).

We thank several colleagues for their guidance throughout this project: Peter Lanjouw's and Otto Simonett's advice came at critical junctures of this study. Dan Tunstall's steadfast support and his vision of a universal application of poverty maps helped us tremendously.

Many colleagues contributed their time and expertise to complete this report. A sincere thank you goes to: Patricia Zurita, for conducting several interviews for Ecuador and Panama; Patti Kristjanson, for contributing to a box on poverty mapping in East Africa; Andy Nelson, Livia Montana, and Philippe Rekacewicz, for sharing boundary files for the final maps; Gracie Bermudez, Camila Bonifaz, Marissa Irwin, and Jillian Salvatore, for assisting with tables, appendixes, and reviews; Johnathan Kool, for producing the maps; and Maggie Powell, Hyacinth Billings, and Janet Fernandez Skaalvik, for guiding the report through production and providing editorial and design assistance.

We greatly appreciate the contributions of Karen Holmes whose writing and editing breathed life into the manuscript.

We have greatly benefited from our reviewers who provided timely and detailed comments on different drafts of this report: Glen Hyman at CIAT; Paul Steele at DfID; Andre Bassolé at EIS Africa; Patti Kristjanson at ILRI; Ergin Ataman and Benjamin Davis at FAO; Otto Simonett at UNEP/GRID-Arendal; Paul Bartel at USAID; Katherine Bolt, Uwe Deichmann, Jesko Hentschel, Peter Lanjouw, and Berk Özler at the World Bank; Navroz Dubash, Christine Elias, Anthony Janetos, Patricia Londoño, Crescencia Maurer, Ralph Ridder, Dan Tunstall, and Patricia Zurita at WRI. Their ideas substantially shaped and improved this document. We retain full responsibility for any remaining errors of fact or interpretation.

NORBERT HENNINGER

MATHILDE SNEL